

Received: 2021-08-30

Accepted: 2021-11-30

Published: 2021-12-29

**Original Article** 

# An Outlook of Hiyal (Legal Stratagems) and Its Compilations in Islamic Economic Literature

Muhammad Omer Rafique<sup>a</sup>, Ahmad Sufian Che Abdullah<sup>b</sup> & Mohd Abd Wahab Fatoni<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Ph.D Islamic finance candidate, Department of Shariah and Management, Academy of Islamic Studies, University of Malaya. 50603 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. Corresponding author, email: <u>omerrafiq1@gmail.com</u>. <sup>b</sup> Senior lecturers at Department of Shariah and Management, Academy of Islamic Studies, University of Malaya 50603 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

### ABSTRACT

Hiyal (legal stratagems) means to find an unconventional way to meet an end in a complicated Shari'ah issue. These stratagems should comply with the Maqasid-e-Shari'ah to remain legal. It has a wide application in today's versatile cutting-edge Shari'ah matters. The research objective of this study is to explore and analyze the manuscripts and compilations from jurists, for and against the application of Hiyal (legal stratagems) in Islamic law in the problem-solving procedure. The study finds that Muslim jurists have strived to develop the Hiyal theory as a solution to fulfill the needs of the era. Hanafi jurists are considered as originators of this concept in Islamic law literature. They have several published compilations containing cases where legal stratagems were applied to solve the problem or may be applied. They were criticized by other jurists for advising such relaxed Hiyal, especially by Hanbali scholars. The majority of the scholars are of the view that all Hiyal are not permissible nor impermissible instead it should be checked on a caseto-case basis. The study is limited to the twelve compilations available to the author. The study uses the content analysis method to achieve its objective. The contemporary Shari'ah scholars may explore these compilations which can support them in finding solutions in the fields of modern Islamic economics and Halal industry.

Keywords: Hiyal, Legal stratagems, Compilations, Maqasid-e-Shari'ah, Islamic economics

### Introduction

Whenever a Shari'ah scholar forbids an action, it is his duty to include a permissible solution in his verdict to fix society's problems<sup>1</sup>. That is because it is not easy to deter people from a particular thing but to provide an alternative route to meet the allowable need, is the true solution to the dilemma. Like a river cannot be prevented from running, instead, a second river can be dug to stop the use of the first canal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Usmani, *Riba Free Banking*.

Jurists of every era from Muslim history have contributed to Islamic law literature and compiled several exits for critical situations which serve as a guide for new scholars to find the solutions in the cutting edge contemporary Shari'ah issues. There is a definite need to highlight the literature of Muslim jurists regarding the Shari'ah engineering in Islamic law to provide some exits to followers.

### **Research Problem**

Since the early days of Shari'ah law, Muslim jurists have been adopting Hiyal (legal stratagems) for the establishment of these alternates<sup>2</sup>. But it has been a controversial subject among theorists of Islamic law in the latter part of history. The use of Hiyal in issuing fatawa (Shari'ah verdicts) is condemned by many Shafi'i, Maliki, and Hanbali scholars<sup>3</sup>. Both the groups, that is the proponents and the opponents have compiled a precious heritage of different stratagems applied in several cases in history.

Dynamic Shari'ah solutions to new challenges are urgently needed in the modern everchanging environment. The growth of Islamic economics against the traditional interest-based structure is a major challenge for Muslim scholars, in particular. In this area, the implementation of stratagems has been widely criticized by academics. The analysis will have a significant effect on Islamic economics scholars in recognizing the elder jurists' approach to addressing Shari'ah financial problems through Hiyal and highlighting the relevant sources for this purpose.

### **Research Objective**

This study aims to explore and investigate the compilations from different jurists about the application of Hiyal (legal stratagems) in problem-solving techniques from their Hiyal scriptures.

### Significance of Legal Stratagems Compilations in Islamic Law

Through academic literature, the flexibility of Islamic law has been underestimated, while this has been a prominent feature of divine Islamic law<sup>4</sup>. Shari'ah law is the living, vibrant, and universal law designed by divine sources. It applies to a village as it applies to the economy of a developed busy city. The clue to its universalness is the flexibility and adaptability in any case. One of the general propositions from the sacred law is "Whenever there is a difficulty, relaxation and flexibility is applied", one similar maxim is "The difficulties permits the impermissible actions"<sup>5</sup>. One of the ways through which the jurists have relaxed the matters for the people in a tough situation is the application of legal stratagems (Hiyal) where a permissible end is reached through an extraordinary way. This involves a great deal of legal expertise and jurisprudence skills.

With the transition of culture and community, the jurisprudence of legal exits develops. The more society and civilization grow, this kind of jurisprudence develops with it, and the more deflation the civilization retains, this kind of jurisprudence persists and freezes. So, it develops with the development of life<sup>6</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Shaybani, *Al-Makaharij Fil -Hiyal*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ibnu Batta, *Ibtal AlHiyal*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Gerber, "Rigidity versus Openness in Late Classical Islamic Law : The Case of the Seventeenth-Century Palestinian Muftī Khayr Al-Dīn Al-Ramlī."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Zarqa, Shar Hul Qawaed Al-Fiqhiyya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Alsaidy, "The Contribution of Figh in Human Siences: History as an Example."

In Islamic history, the views of older experts are commonly preferred. The attempt was to relate the decision's argument to the views of previous Imams or even Sahaba's companions<sup>7</sup>. These precedents have been used as an argument as well as justification. The distinction between the two ways of aiding the opinion from precedent is that argument is used before the jurisdiction and the justification is presented after the order is declared<sup>8</sup>.

In Islamic jurisprudence, the term 'Nawāzil' is used for precedents. This means the compilations of the latter part of the jurists, not the earlier jurists. 'Nawāzil' is jurisprudential literature contributed by judges, muftis, or experts on the topic of actual events to decide on them or to justify the legal opinion on them. Since its inception, Islamic law has stressed much of this prior judicial system. Fiqh-un-Nawāzil is a subset of fiqh (Islamic jurisprudence) discussing contemporary problems (newly emerging problems)<sup>9</sup>.

### Hiyal (Legal Stratagems) Definition

The classical scholars have defined the *Hiyal* in two styles<sup>10</sup>: One is a broader meaning, that is: "any clandestine means of getting rid of a problem or an exit". The Arabic word *Makhraj* describes the same. The definers are Imām Qurtubi, Al- Hamawi, Al-Sha'bi, and others<sup>11</sup>. Al-'asqalani has defined it with the phrases: "Hila is something through which you reach your goal in a hidden way"<sup>12</sup>.

The second and the narrowed meaning for this word indicates a backdoor solution of the issue which results in transforming an impermissible to permissible. The scholars preferring this, are namely lbn <sup>13</sup>, his student <sup>14</sup>, and <sup>15</sup>. Fares <sup>16</sup> defined *Hiyal* as legal loopholes or artifices. Cesar and Greg explained *Hiyal* as "legal stratagems designed to reach impermissible ends by formal lawful means"<sup>17</sup>.

Mansoori gave a detailed and comprehensive definition, he said "the use of legal means for extra-legal ends that could not, whether themselves are legal or illegal, be achieved directly with the means provided by the Sharī'ah. It enables persons who would otherwise have had no choice but to act against the provisions of sacred law, to arrive at the desired result while conforming to the letter of the law" <sup>18</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Nyazee, Introduction to Al-Hidayah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Schauer, "Precedent," 571.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Terem, "Redefining Islamic Tradition: Legal Interpretation as a Medium for Innovation in the Making of Modern Morocco."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Mansoori, "Use of Hiyal in Islamic Finance and Its Shariah Legitimacy."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Arabi, Ahkamul Qur'an; Al-Hamawi, Al Ashbah Wa Nazaer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Al-'Asqalani, Fatḥ Al-Bārī Fī Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ Al-Bukhārī.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Taemiyyah (1991)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Ibn Qayyim (1991)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Al-Shatbi (1964)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Djafri (2018b)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Arjona and Jehle, "Islamic Law and the Limits of Amorality : Re- Conceptualizing the Legal Ethics of Transnational Islamic Finance."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Mansoori, "Use of Hiyal in Islamic Finance and Its Shariah Legitimacy."

#### Rafique, et.al. / Online Journal of Research in Islamic Studies 8(3) (2021): 37-49

Shariah ban or practical difficulty



# Makhraj or Hilah or stratagem

FIGURE: Author's illustration for Hilah/legal stratagem concept

### Difference Between Hilah and Makhraj

It is not a straightforward feat to draw a line between the appropriate approach and the permissible way-outs recommended by jurists and the impermissible methods and tricks used to evade Shari'ah's objectives. *Hilah* can be defined as a trick or stratagem<sup>19</sup>, while *makhraj* may be defined as a licit exit or relief<sup>20</sup>. Smolo and co-writers distinguished between makhraj and *hilah* and said the previous one is a legal exit, and the last one is a trick. They applied 'intent' to explain the difference between the two jargons: *makhraj* tries to comply with the *Shari'ah* excluded constraint <sup>21</sup>. While, in the case of *hilah*, the intention normally is to execute the prohibited action. Alamgiri stated: Any Hilah which leads to destroying someone's secured right or make it ambiguous is void, and the Hilah designed to avoid a Harām and reach to Halāl is good'<sup>22</sup>.

### Contribution of Jurists in the Legal Stratagem Literature

### Contribution of Hanafi Jurists

As far as the hanafi jurists are concerned, they are considered as the master of this science. Their unique theory to draw a line between two types of stratagems is the prejudice and defensive nature of Hiyal<sup>23</sup>. Hanafi standpoint regarding the is almost the same as other madhahib, although, the older scriptures of Hanafi literature do not use this terminology as much as done in the later centuries. So, the legal devices considered by them as legitimate are only those which do not evade the spirit of the law<sup>24</sup>. These devices are more of remedies to attest to the legal doctrine, not tools of evasion as understood by some contemporary jurists<sup>25</sup>. Al-Alusi, a 13th-century hijra Iraqi scholar, wrote that:" To me, every hilah that evades Hikmah Shar'iyyah is rejected, like the hilah for escaping from Zakat"<sup>26</sup>. The limitation of not evading Qasd al-Shar'i

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Abu Jib, *Al-Qamus Al-Fighi*; Cowan, "Hans Wehr: A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic (Arabic-Ennglish)."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Abu Jib, *Al-Qamus Al-Fighi*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Musa and Smolo, "Al-Hilah (Legal Trick) and Al-Makhraj (Legal Exit): The Difference between the Two and Their Application in Islamic Finance."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Alamgir, Al-Fatawa Alamgiri.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Agha, "Hila Ki Sharai Hesiat."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Horii, "Rreconsideration of Legal Devices (Hiyal) in Islamic Jurisprudence: The Hanafīs and Their 'Exits' (Makhārij)."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Ghanem, "Al-Hiyal Al-Mubaha Wa Adillatuha Inda Al-Hanafiya."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Al-Alusi, Ar-Rūh Al-Ma'ānī Fī Tafsīri-l-Qur'āni-l-'Azīm Wa Sab'u-l-Mathānī.

leads to the natural rule that, involvement in any kind of hilah should not lead to the actualization of a Shari'ah objective at the cost of a higher objective.

One authoritative rule narrated from the classical text to identify the hila in Hanafi doctrine is:' Any hilah designed to evade other's right is Haram, and any hilah opted as a mean to Halal and restrain from Haram is permissible and rewardable'<sup>27</sup>. Among the founders of Hanafi madhab, Abu Yusuf is the most lenient in allowing the use of Hiyal, and his student, Muhammad bin Hasan Shaybani is quite moderate in allowing certain Hiyals and prohibiting others<sup>28</sup>. Al-Shaybani stressed the preventing nature of makharij (not causing prejudice to another), while Abu Yusuf emphasized strategies available to those who know how to use them<sup>29</sup>.

### Contribution of Shafi'i Jurists

Imam Shafi'i is considered as one of the proponents of the Hiyal theory. He opposed the Maliki principle of Saddi-e-Darae', which is contrary to Hiyal. The followers of Shafi'i jurisprudence consider the application of legal stratagems prohibited in general with some exceptions. They highlighted the importance of intention in the legitimacy of the action although they are criticized for allowing the controversial contract of 'ina, and it is executed even with bad intent<sup>30</sup>. There is a compilation from Al-Qazwini a Shafi'I jurist named as *Al-Hiyal Ash-Shariyya*<sup>31</sup>, which was highlighted by Joseph Schacht in their doctoral thesis<sup>32</sup>.

### Contribution of Maliki Jurists

Maliki jurists are very strict on the unlawfulness of certain Hiyal. They even stop the ways that may reach to an evil (Sadd-e-zarae')<sup>33</sup>. The Maliki jurist Suhnun, while discussing the legal stratagems in Mudawwanah, rejected the concept of hilah and proposed a concept Sadd-e-Darae'<sup>34</sup>. Another Mālikī jurist, Qarafi describes the concept: Sadd al-dharai' means to stop the practices leading to sleaze to eradicate it. If an activity that is itself free from corruption (mafsadah) is used as a means of corruption, Imam Mālik prohibited that act in numerous cases<sup>35</sup>.

Al-Shāţibī, the late Maliki jurist, also explained the hilah categories through the theory of the maqāşid<sup>36</sup>. Imām Al-Ghazālī the prominent philosopher of the fifth century Hijrah, categorized the maqasid into five famous major components<sup>37</sup>. Al-Shāţibī divided the Hiyal into three categories; those which are unanimously invalidated, those which are unanimously endorsed, and finally, those in which the jurists differ. If hilah leads to the actualization of the desired purpose without threatening Islamic law, it would be accepted as permissible and vice versa<sup>38</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Agha, "Hila Ki Sharai Hesiat."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Al-Murghinani, "Kitab-Ul-Buyu'."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Horii, "Rreconsideration of Legal Devices (Hiyal) in Islamic Jurisprudence: The Hanafīs and Their 'Exits' (Makhārij)."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Alsayyed, "Shari'ah Board, The Task of Fatwa, and Ijtihad in Islamic Economics, and Finance."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Al-Qazwini, *Al-Hiyal Ash-Shariyya*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> van Donzel et al., "Encyclopaedia of Islam: New Edition."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Mansoori, "Use of Hiyal in Islamic Finance and Its Shariah Legitimacy."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Horii, "Rreconsideration of Legal Devices (Hiyal) in Islamic Jurisprudence: The Hanafīs and Their 'Exits' (Makhārij)."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Al-Enezi, "Fiqh Al-Handasa Al-Māliya Al-Islāmiya."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Muhammed Imran, "Legal Stratagem (Hiyal) And Usury in Islamic Commercial Law."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Al-Ghazālī, Al-Mustasfa Fi 'ilm Al-Isul.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Syed and Omar, "Hiyal in Islamic Finance: A Recognition of Genuine Economic Need or Circumvention of Riba?"

### Contribution of Hanbali Jurists

The significant oppositions of Hiyal(legal stratagems) are Ibn Batta, Ibn Taiymiyyah<sup>39</sup>, and his student ibn Qayyim from Hanbali jurisprudence. They reached to the extent that Hiyal is to deceive God<sup>40</sup>. Ibnu Batta in his book, Ibtal al-Hiyal narrated a hadith that Abu Hurairah reported the Prophet (peace be upon him) said: "Do not commit what the Jews committed so that you would make halāl what Allah has prohibited with the slightest Hiyal (tricks or ruse)" <sup>41</sup>. Hanafi scholars were also heavily criticized for their behavior in proposing Hiyal by Imām Bukhari, the Maliki Muhaddis, by writing a complete chapter against them in his Saḥiḥ.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Ibn Qayyim, *E'lam-Ul-Muwaqqi'een*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Ibnu Batta, *Ibtal AlHiyal*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Ibnu Batta.

Serial	Title of compilation	Author	Affiliation	Purpose of compilation
No.				
1.	Kitab al-Makharij Fi'l-Ḥiyal	Muhammad Ibn Al-hasan Ash- shaibani	<u> </u> Hanafi	Collection of prescribed stratagems in particular scenarios
2.	Kitab al-Khassaf fil Ḥiyal	Ahmad bin amr Al-Khassaf,	Ḥanafi	Collection of prescribed stratagems in particular scenarios
3.	Al-Ḥiyal fil Fiqh	Al-Qazwini, Mahmud bin Hasan	Shafi'i	Collection and critique of stratagems
4.	Doctoral Thesis on books of Al- Khassaf, Al- Qazweeni and Muhammad bin Hasan al- Shaybani	Joseph Schacht <sup>42</sup>	Orientalist	A critique-based translation and commentary of three manuscripts regarding Ḥiyal.
5.	Kitab-ul- Ḥiyal	Muhammad bin Ismail Al- Bukhari <sup>43</sup>	Shafi'i	Compendium of Prophetic traditions condemning application of stratagems and criticizing particular illicit Ḥiyal.
6.	Kitab-ul- Ḥiyal fil Mabsoot <sup>44</sup>	Muhammad bin Ahmad AL- Sarakhsi(d/483 AH)	<u></u> Hanafi	Compilation of permissible Hiyal with a speech on legitimacy.
7.	Kitab-ul-Ḥiyal	Committee of scholars of King Alamgir (d/ 1618) <sup>45</sup>	<u></u> Hanafi	29 chapters of a systematic anthology of Hiyal
8.	Jannat al-ahkam wa-junnat al- khussdm	Saeed bin Ali, Al-Samarqandi (10 <sup>th</sup> Century Hijra scholar) <sup>46</sup>	Hanafi	Collection of prescribed Hiyal especially from Hanafi books.

# TABLE: Compilations and Works On Hiyal(Legal Stratagems)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Minhaji, "Joseph Schacht' S Contribution To the Study of Islamic Law"; Layish, "Notes on Joseph Schacht'S Contribution to the Study of Islamic Law."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Bukhari, "Kitabul Hiyal,."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Al-Sarakhsi, *AL-Mabsoot*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Alamgir, *Al-Fatawa Alamgiri*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Baloot and Baloot, *Al-Turas Al-Islami-Almakhtootatwal Matbooat*.

9.	lbtal al-Ḥiyal	Ibnu Batta, Ubaidullah bin Muhammad (d/387AH)	Ḥanbali	Criticizing the application of Hiyal by narrations of companions and successors
10.	Bayan ud daleel ala-butlan al- tahleeel <sup>47</sup>	Ibn Taemiyyah,	<u> </u> Hanbali	Focusing on the marriage of Halala the author presented a solid argument against Hiyal.
11.	E'lam-ul-Muwaqqi'een	Ibn Qayyim, Shams al-Dîn Abû'Abdillah Al-Jauziyyah	Ḥanbali	The book has a deliberation against Ḥiyal theory following his teacher Ibn Taemiyyah.
12.	Al-Muafaqat <sup>48</sup>	Ibraheem bin Musa Al-Shatbi,	<u></u> Hanbali	In the third volume, the author presented a valuable and decisive discussion on Hiyal along with some examples.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Taemiyyah, *Bayan Ud Daleel Ala-Butlan Al-Tahleeel*.
 <sup>48</sup> Al-Shatbi, *Al-Muafaqat*.

# 1. Kitab al-Makharij Fil-Hiyal by Muhammad Ibn Al-hasan Ash-shaybani

Shaybani's work was the earliest one in the context, so it received the most criticism from scholars. The qādī of Kufa Sharīk ibn 'Abdullah is the first scholar to denounce Kitāb al-Ḥiyal, stating that it is a book of deception<sup>49</sup>. His comments can be taken as a piece of evidence for the authorship of the Kitāb al-Ḥiyal, because his death is in 177 A.H., in the era of Imam Muhammad bin Hasan Shaybani. This book was published by Maktaba Saqafah Deeniyyah In Cairo. The book is comprised of 25chapters containing stratagems regarding different components of Islamic law.

# 2. Kitab al-Khassaf fil Hiyal by Ahmad bin 'amr Al-Khassaf

Khassaf was a prominent and highly ranked Hanafi jurist of his time. His compilation is a significant contribution to this theory. Although, in most of the cases he has elaborated the stratagems prescribed by Muhammad Ibn Al-Hasan Ash-Shaybani. This compilation consists of 55 chapters along with a preface proving the illegitimacy of the application of Hiyal.

# 3. Al-Hiyal fil Fiqh by Mahmud bin Hasan Al-Qazwini

This is one of the very few works done by Shafi'i jurists on this topic. This is a shorter compilation as compared to the Hanafi works, consisting of more than 100 pages. This compilation was published in Yemeni. The author has divided all the legal stratagems into three chapters. The impermissible stratagems, disliked stratagems, and permissible legal stratagems.

# 4. Doctoral thesis on books of Al-Khassaf, Al- Qazweeni and Muhammad bin Hasan al-Shaybani by Joseph Schacht

Joseph Schacht was a famous orientalist of the twentieth century, his subject of study was theology and Islamic law, but the main focus was Islamic law<sup>50</sup>. He is also considered as a significant thought producer in Hadith Studies<sup>51</sup>, He was also considered by some modern writers as a separate component on orientalist view on Hadith <sup>52</sup>. He Accomplished his doctoral thesis on the topic of Hiyal from Schlesischen Friedrich Wilhelm Universitat, in 1923, working on three different scriptures of Hiyal. Schacht was also of the opinion that Hiyal were originated in Iraq, not in Medinese jurisprudence<sup>53</sup>.

## 5. Kitab-ul- Hiyal by Muhammad bin Ismail Al-Bukhari

This is a chapter from the Sahih of Imam al Bukhari. He was among the great criticizers of Hanafi scholars on the notion of Hiyal. He criticizes these jurists without naming them in his famous book by just mentioning the phrase "Some people said". His objections are answered by some of the Hanafi scholars.

# 6. Kitab-ul- Hiyal fil Mabsoot by Muhammad bin Ahmad AL-Sarakhsi(d/483 AH)

<sup>49</sup> Al-Şaymarī, Akhbār Abī Ḥanīfa Wa Aṣḥābihī.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Layish, "The Transformation of the Sharī'a from Jurists' Law to Statutory Law in the Contemporary Muslim World."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Schacht, "A Revaluation of Islamic Traditions."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Suadi, "Menyoal Kritik Sanad Joseph Schacht."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Layish, "The Transformation of the Sharī'a from Jurists' Law to Statutory Law in the Contemporary Muslim World."

This is also a specific chapter from the historical work of imam al-Sarakhsi. In this chapter, he narrated the legal stratagems advised by Muhammad Ibn Al-Hasan Ash-Shaybani and added some stratagems from his own.

# 7. Kitab-ul-Hiyal by Committee of scholars of King Alamgir (d/ 1618)

This is a component of the comprehensive and systematic work of the seventeenth century. It was compiled by a Royal Board of scholars under the supervision of a Lahori scholar "Shaykh Nizam". He was assisted by six other ulamas. However, the names of four of them are known. They are: 1) Muhammad Jamil, Zia' al-Din, 2)Jalal al-Din Husayn and 3)Muhammad Husayn. <sup>54</sup>. It is a compilation of Nawazil cases collected by the committee appointed by the emperor Alamgir. This chapter comprises of hundreds of Hiyal further categorized into different subchapters. These cases are related to worships, social relations like marriage and divorce, etc, and monetary transactions like sale, leasing, and investment ventures.

# 8. Jannat al-ahkam wa-junnat al-khussam by Saeed bin Ali Al-Samarqandi

This is an unpublished manuscript accessed and reviewed through alukah.net, available at the library of Jamia Azhar, Cairo. This manuscript comprises several legal stratagems most of which seems to be from the book of imam Mohammed. The author has classified the stratagems into fiqhi chapters. This manuscript should be brought into publication after a detailed and rigorous analysis.

# 9. Ibtal al-Hiyal by Ibnu Batta, Ubaidullah bin Muhammad (d/387AH)

This book was written by a prominent Hanbali jurist in the opposition to Hiyal theory. This book comprises of a lot of severe criticism on advocates of Hiyal theory. Ibnu Batta's thesis can be summarized under three arguments in these words: "i) The legal rules must be used as per their prescription and divine mandate and the Hiyal do the exact opposite. ii)The Hiyal are deceptions as they outwardly simulate licit actions whereas inwardly, they aim to legalize the proscribed. iii)The intentions of the parties are critical in determining the legality of actions".

## **Discussion and Conclusion**

- The above elaboration states that Muslim jurists, from all the schools of thought, have produced sufficient literature for and against the application of Hiyal (legal stratagems) in solving the difficult Shari'ah problems.
- The Hanafi legacy and some of Shafi'i scholars are proponents for the Hiyal theory, while Hanbali scholars and Maliki doctrine are against the concept. Although, all of those jurists who have a strict stance on the point, do relax the ruling in situations of difficulty.
- This is why most of the latest writers on this point like Al-Shatbi and Ibnul-Qayyim concluded that not all the stratagems legitimate nor all are illegitimate, instead there should be some checkpoints for any stratagem to be applied to analyze it, like the intention of the doer, the degree of inconvenience, the department of Islamic law in which it is being applied (Ebadaat, Mu'amlaat etc.)
- The above deliberation highlights one interesting fact that orientalists were also interested in legal stratagems of jurists. They drew some mispresenting conclusion regarding jurists specially Hanafis, that the rigid Islamic law was not able cope up with the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Munir, "Precedent in Islamic Law with Special Reference to the Federal Shariat Court and the Legal System in Pakistan."

### Rafique, et.al. / Online Journal of Research in Islamic Studies 8(3) (2021): 37-49

practice of society which induced the jurists to advise some stratagem to evade the law. These misleading injunctions should be tackled in proper way.

- The application of Hiyal (legal stratagems), that is to fulfill the need of the scenario while complying with the apparent legal rulings of Shari'ah, has immense significance in today's changing economic world.
- The above tiring efforts of Muslim jurists can contribute widely to solving the cutting edge of contemporary Shari'ah problems. But the application of these stratagems should be within the boundaries of Maqasid-e-Shari'ah, and it should be closely watched and audited from time to time.

### References

Abu Jib, S. Al-Qamus Al-Fighi. Damascus: Darul-Fikr, 1988.

Agha, Sayed Bacha. "Hila Ki Sharai Hesiat." Bayyinat 6 (2013): 30–33.

- Al-'Asqalani, Ibn Hajar. Fath Al-Bārī Fī Sharh Ṣahīh Al-Bukhārī. Cairo: Mustafa al-Babi al-Halabi, 1959.
- Al-Alusi, Mahmud. Ar-Rūh Al-Ma'ānī Fī Tafsīri-l-Qur'āni-l-'Azīm Wa Sab'u-l-Mathānī. Beirut: Dar Ihia al-Turath al-Arabi, 2000.
- Al-Enezi, M. "Fiqh Al-Handasa Al-Māliya Al-Islāmiya." Qassim: Qassim University, 2015.
- Al-Ghazālī, Abu Hamid. Al-Mustasfa Fi 'ilm Al-Isul. Beirut: Darul Kutub Ilmiyyah, 1993.
- Al-Hamawi, Ahmad bin Muhammad. Al Ashbah Wa Nazaer. Beirut: Darul Kutub Ilmiyyah, 1999.
- Al-Murghinani, Ali bin Bakr. "Kitab-Ul-Buyu'." In Al-Hidayah. Istanbul, 1985.
- Al-Qazwini, Mahmud bin Hasan. Al-Hiyal Ash-Shariyya. Sana'a: Dar al Meeras Al Nabawi, 2012.
- Al-Sarakhsi, Muhammad bin Ahmad. AL-Mabsoot. Beirut: Dar-ul-Mariafa, 1993.
- Al-Şaymarī, Abū ʿAbdullah Ḥusayn ibn ʿAlī. *Akhbār Abī Ḥanīfa Wa Aṣḥābihī*. Beirut: Ālam al-Kutub, 1985.
- Al-Shatbi, Ibraheem bin Musa. Al-Muafaqat. Cairo: Maktabah Tauqifiyyah, 1964.
- Alamgir, Scholars committee of King. Al-Fatawa Alamgiri. Quetta: Maktabah Majdiyyah, 1983.
- Alsaidy, Ahmed. "The Contribution of Fiqh in Human Siences: History as an Example." Journal of Human Sciences 2016, no. 1 (2016): 85–115. https://doi.org/10.12785/jhs/20160103.
- Alsayyed, Nidal. "Shari'ah Board, The Task of Fatwa, and Ijtihad in Islamic Economics, and Finance." *Finance*, no. 20204 (2010). http://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/20204.
- Arabi, Ibnul. Ahkamul Qur'an. Darul Kutub Al-Alamiyah, Beirut, Tt. Cairo: Darul Kutub Tauqifiyyah, 1967.
- Arjona, Csar, and Greg Jehle. "Islamic Law and the Limits of Amorality : Re- Conceptualizing the Legal Ethics of Transnational Islamic Finance." TRANSNATIONAL LAW & CONTEMPORARY PROBLEMS 27, no. Summer (2018): 275.
- Baloot, Ali raza Qurra, and Ahmad toran Qurra Baloot. *Al-Turas Al-Islami-Almakhtootatwal Matbooat*. Qaisari-Turkey: Dar-al Aqaba, 2001.
- Bukhari, Muhammad-bin-Ismail. "Kitabul Hiyal,." In Al Sahih. Beirut: Daru Taowqin Najah, 2000.

- Cowan, J Milton. "Hans Wehr: A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic (Arabic-Ennglish)," 1980.
- Djafri, Fares. "LSE HBKU Workshop | February 23, 2017 Applying Hiyal & Makharij and Other Islamic Principles," no. June (2018).
- Donzel, E J van, Edmund Bosworth, Wolfhart Heinrichs, and Thierry Bianquis. "Encyclopaedia of Islam: New Edition." Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 1960. https://brill.com/view/serial/EIE.
- Gerber, Haim. "Rigidity versus Openness in Late Classical Islamic Law: The Case of the Seventeenth-Century Palestinian Muftī Khayr Al-Dīn Al-Ramlī." *Islamic Law and Society* 5, no. 2 (1998): 165–95.
- Ghanem, Saleh. "Al-Hiyal Al-Mubaha Wa Adillatuha Inda Al-Hanafiya." *Jamia Takreet for Islamic Studies* 7, no. 22 (2015): 58–84.
- Horii, Satoe. "Rreconsideration of Legal Devices (Hiyal) in Islamic Jurisprudence: The Hanafis and Their 'Exits' (Makhārij)." Islamic Law and Society 9, no. 3 (2002): 312–57. https://doi.org/10.1163/156851902320901189.
- Ibn Qayyim, Shams al-Dîn Abû'Abdillah Al-Jauziyyah. E'lam-Ul-Muwaqqi'een. Dâr Al-Kutub Al-'Ilmiyyah. Beirut: Darul Kutub Ilmiyyah, 1991.
- Ibnu Batta, Ubaidullah bin Muhammad. Ibtal AlHiyal. 2nd ed. Beirut: Al-Maktab Al-Islami, 1983.
- Layish, Aharon. "Notes on Joseph Schacht'S Contribution to the Study of Islamic Law." British Society for Middle Eastern Studies. Bulletin, 1982. https://doi.org/10.1080/13530198208705347.
- Layish, Aharon. "The Transformation of the Sharī'a from Jurists' Law to Statutory Law in the Contemporary Muslim World." *Welt Des Islams* 44, no. 1 (2004): 85–113. https://doi.org/10.1163/157006004773712587.
- Mansoori, Muhammad Tahir. "Use of Hiyal in Islamic Finance and Its Shariah Legitimacy." Journal of Islamic Business and Management 1, no. 1 (2011): 69–92.
- Minhaji, Akh. "Joseph Schacht' S Contribution To the Study of Islamic Law." McGill University Canada, 1992.
- Muhammed Imran, Ismail. "Legal Stratagem (Hiyal) And Usury in Islamic Commercial Law." University of Birmingham, 2010. http://etheses.bham.ac.uk/id/eprint/1325/.
- Munir, Muhammad. "Precedent in Islamic Law with Special Reference to the Federal Shariat Court and the Legal System in Pakistan." *Islamic Studies* 47, no. 4 (2008): 445–82. https://doi.org/10.2307/20839140.
- Musa, Abubakar Muhammad, and Edib Smolo. "Al-Hilah (Legal Trick) and Al-Makhraj (Legal Exit): The Difference between the Two and Their Application in Islamic Finance." In International Seminar on "Muamalat, Islamic Economics and Finance (SMEKI 09)," October 20-21, 2009, Faculty of Islamic Studies, University Kebangsaan Malaysia, Malaysia. Kulliyyah of Economics and Management Sciences, International Islamic ..., 2009.
- Nyazee, Imran A. K. Introduction to Al-Hidayah. Bristol: Amal Press, 2006.
- Schacht, J. "A Revaluation of Islamic Traditions." *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* 81, no. 3–4 (1949): 143–54. https://doi.org/doi:10.1017/S0035869X00102916.

- Schauer, F. "Precedent." *Stanford Law Review* 39, no. 3 (1987): 571–605. https://doi.org/10.2307/1228760.
- Shaybani, Muhammad bin Hasan. Al-Makaharij Fil -Hiyal. Cairo: Maktabah Saqafah Diniyyah, 1999.
- Suadi, Hasan. "Menyoal Kritik Sanad Joseph Schacht." Riwayah : Jurnal Studi Hadis; Vol 2, No 1 (2016): Riwayah : Jurnal Studi HadisDO - 10.21043/Riwayah.V2i1.1622, March 29, 2017. http://journal.stainkudus.ac.id/index.php/riwayah/article/view/1622.
- Syed, Ehsanullah Agha, and Mustafa Omar. "Hiyal in Islamic Finance: A Recognition of Genuine Economic Need or Circumvention of Riba?" *Qualitative Research in Financial Markets* 9, no. 4 (2017): 382–90. https://doi.org/10.1108/QRFM-05-2017-0041.
- Taemiyyah, Ibn. Bayan Ud Daleel Ala-Butlan Al-Tahleeel. Beirut: Al-Maktab Al-Islami, 1998.
- Taemiyyah, Ibn. Iqamatu Daleel Ala Ibtal Al-Tahleel. Beirut: Darul Kutub Ilmiyyah, 1991.
- Terem, Etty. "Redefining Islamic Tradition: Legal Interpretation as a Medium for Innovation in the Making of Modern Morocco." *Islamic Law and Society* 20, no. 4 (2013): 425–75. https://doi.org/10.1163/15685195-0204P0003.

Usmani, Mufti Muhammad Taqi. Riba Free Banking. Karachi: Quranic Studies Publishers, 2009.

Zarqa, Mustafa. Shar Hul Qawaed Al-Fiqhiyya. Damacus: Dar al-Qalm, 1989.